



HISTORIC LANDMARKS COMMISSION HEARING AGENDA

WEDNESDAY APRIL 2, 2008

SYNOPSIS

Study Session

Preservation in San José's Future

5:00 p.m. – T-332

Regular Session

6:00 P.M.

Council Wing, Rooms W-118 & W-119

200 East Santa Clara Street

San José, CA

COMMISSION MEMBERS

EDWARD JANKE, AIA, CHAIR

PATRICIA COLOMBE, VICE CHAIR

HELENE LAVELLE SCOTT CUNNINGHAM

DANA PEAK JUDY STABILE

ERIC THACKER

JOSEPH HORWEDEL, DIRECTOR

DEPARTMENT OF PLANNING, BUILDING AND CODE ENFORCEMENT

NOTE

To arrange an accommodation under the Americans with Disabilities Act to participate in this public meeting, we ask that you call (408) 277-4576 (VOICE) or (408) 998-5299 (TTY) at least two business days before the meeting. If you have questions or concerns, please contact Carmen Stanley at (408) 535-7856.

NOTICE TO THE PUBLIC

Good evening, my name is **Ed Janke**, and I am the Chair of the Historic Landmarks Commission. On behalf of the Commission, I would like to welcome you to tonight's meeting. I will now call to order the **April 2, 2008** meeting of the Historic Landmarks Commission. Please remember to turn off your cell phones and pagers.

If you want to address the Commission, **fill out a speaker card (located at the technician's station), and give the completed card to the technician. Please include the agenda item number for reference.**

The procedure for public hearings is as follows:

- After the staff report, *applicants may make a five-minute presentation.*
- Anyone wishing to speak in favor of the proposal should prepare to come forward. After the proponents speak, anyone wishing to speak in opposition should prepare to come forward. *Each speaker will have two minutes.*
- Commissioners may ask questions of the speakers. These questions will not reduce the speaker's time allowance.
- The Commission will then close the public hearing. The Historic Landmarks Commission will take action on the item.

The procedure for referrals is as follows:

- Anyone wishing to speak on a referral should prepare to come forward. *Each speaker will have one minute.*
- Commissioners may ask questions of the speakers. These questions will not reduce the speaker's time allowance.
- The Historic Landmarks Commission will comment on the referral item.

If a Commissioner would like a topic to be addressed under one of the Good and Welfare items, please contact Planning staff in advance of the Commission meeting.

An agenda and a copy of all staff reports have been placed on the table for your convenience.

AGENDA
ORDER OF BUSINESS
6:00 PM SESSION

1. ROLL CALL

Commissioner Lavelle absent.

2. DEFERRALS

Any item scheduled for hearing this evening for which deferral is being requested will be taken out of order to be heard first on the matter of deferral. If you want to change any of the deferral dates recommended or speak to the question of deferring these or any other items, you should say so at this time.

No items for deferral

The matter of deferrals is now closed

3. CONSENT CALENDAR

NOTICE TO THE PUBLIC

The consent calendar items are considered to be routine and will be adopted by one motion. There will be no separate discussion of these items unless a request is made by a member of the Historic Landmarks Commission, staff or the public to have an item removed from the consent calendar and considered separately. If anyone in the audience wishes to speak on one of these items, please make your request at this time.

- a. [HP08-001](#). Historic Preservation Permit to allow new construction of a 650-square-foot detached garage in the rear of the property. The project location, a single-family residence on a 0.1 acre site at 350 N. 4th Street, is a Contributing Structure to the Hensley City Landmark Historic District. Timothy Owens, Owner/Applicant. Council District: 3. SNI: 13th Street. CEQA: Exempt. *Project Manager, D. McBain.*

Staff Recommendation: Historic Landmarks Commission find that the proposed work conforms to the Secretary of the Interior's Standards and recommend approval to the Director of Planning as recommended by staff.

Commissioners expressed concern about 1) height of proposed rear wall (15') adjacent to rear property line and 2) architectural compatibility of proposed "shed"-type roof design in the context of the historic neighborhood.

MOTION TO RECOMMEND APPROVAL WITH THE CONDITION THAT THE APPLICANTS MODIFY THE ROOF DESIGN TO INCLUDE A RIDGELINE CLOSER TO THE MIDDLE OF THE BUILDING TO ADDRESS THE CONCERNS ABOUT HEIGHT AND APPEARANCE (6-0-1, LAVELLE ABSENT)

- b. [Addition of Qualifying Properties to the San José Historic Resources Inventory](#) located at: 12320 Mabury, Rd.; 140 E. Virginia St.; 1819 Park Ave.; 496 Emory St. (Master Metal Products Co.); 447 W. Saint John St. (Forman's Arena); 428-430 W. Julian St.; and 436, 446, 456, 465, and 466 Autumn Ct.

Staff Recommendation: Historic Landmarks Commission adopt a Resolution listing the Qualifying Properties on the City of San José Historic Resources Inventory.

The property owner of 140 E. Virginia Street and an associate spoke in opposition to adding the property to the HRI. Deferring the action on this property to a subsequent HLC hearing was discussed, to allow the property owners and representatives more time to gather information about the HRI.

MOTION TO APPROVE THE PROPOSED HRI ADDITIONS WITH THE EXCEPTION OF 140 E. VIRGINIA STREET; AND THAT THE ADDITION OF 140 E. VIRGINIA TO THE HRI BE CONTINUED TO THE NEXT HLC HEARING BUT NO LONGER THAN THAT (5-1-1, THACKER OPPOSED, LAVELLE ABSENT)

Subsequent to the motion being passed, the property owner of 428 W. Julian indicated that he had submitted a speaker card and, while not explicitly opposed to the property being added to the HRI, stated that City time and efforts would be more effectively allocated on other more significant resources.

The Consent Calendar is now closed.

4. PUBLIC HEARINGS

- a. [SP08-006](#). The project being referred is an application for the demolition of one single-family detached residence to allow subdivision into six (6) lots, located on the southwest corner of Willow Glen Way and Creek Drive (660 Willow Glen Way) on a 0.878 gross acre site. (Masoumi Bros. LLC, Applicant). Council District: 6. SNI: None. CEQA: In Process.
Project Manager, A. Baty
1. **Addition to the San José Historic Resources Inventory** of the single-family residence identified as qualified for the Inventory as a Structure of Merit.

Staff Recommendation: Historic Landmarks Commission adopt a Resolution listing the Qualifying Property on the City of San José Historic Resources Inventory.

DEFERRED FROM 03-05-08

Jeffrey Hare, speaking on behalf of the applicants, requested that HLC defer its decision on adding the house to the HRI in order to allow time for a revised site plan to be prepared and presented in light of the consulting arborist's recommendations for preserving the existing Heritage Tree on the site. Staff clarified that the questions before HLC are 1) whether or not to add the identified structure to the HRI, and 2) the HLC's recommendations for disposition of the building (demolition, preservation, etc.).

MOTION TO ADD THE BUILDING TO THE HRI AND, IN ADDITION, TO STATE THAT THE COMMISSION WOULD SUPPORT THE PRESERVATION OF THE IDENTIFIED STRUCTURE OF MERIT AND RECOMMEND PROJECT

ALTERNATIVES THAT WOULD INCLUDE INTEGRATING THE STRUCTURE INTO THE PROJECT AT A SCALE COMPATIBLE WITH THE EXISTING NEIGHBORHOOD. (6-0-1, LAVELLE ABSENT).

- b. [SP07-091](#). The project being referred is an application for the demolition of a 906 square foot residence and tank house to allow the subdivision of the lot into two (2) separate lots, located on the northwest corner of Hibiscus Land and Williams Road (4005 Williams Road)(Marie F. Vierra, Owner). Council District: 1. SNI: None CEQA: Exempt. *Project Manager, A. Baty*
1. **Addition to the San José Historic Resources Inventory** of the single-family residence identified as qualified for the Inventory as a Structure of Merit.

Staff Recommendation: Historic Landmarks Commission adopt a Resolution listing the Qualifying Property on the City of San José Historic Resources Inventory.

The applicant, Amir Amiri, spoke in favor of the proposed project. Commissioner Thacker expressed concern about how the applicability of the required permit findings for demolition. Commissioner Stabile spoke against demolition of historic buildings without a project for any proposed new construction being on file for consideration.

MOTION TO ADD THE PROPERTY TO THE HRI AND TO INTEGRATE THE IDENTIFIED STRUCTURES INTO A PROJECT THAT IS COMPATIBLE WITH THE EXISTING NEIGHBORHOOD, WITH REHABILITATION AND REUSE OF THE IDENTIFIED STRUCTURES. (6-0-1, LAVELLE ABSENT)

- c. [HP07-002](#). Historic Preservation Permit to facilitate restoration of Pellier Park, a 0.3-acre public park and City Landmark site located at the northeast corner of W. Saint James Street and Terraine Street. (City of San José Dept. of Parks, Recreation, and Neighborhood Services, Owner; Barry Swenson Builder, Developer). Council District: 3. SNI Area: None. CEQA: Exempt. *Project Manager, D. McBain.*

Staff Recommendation: Historic Landmarks Commission find that the proposed work conforms to the Secretary of the Interior's Standards and recommend approval to the Director of Planning as recommended by staff.

Commissioners asked about several elements of the park design (e.g., fences, gates, specimen tree types) and suggested several changes to the proposed building materials. Two members of the public, Bonnie Bamburg and Brian Grayson, spoke in support of the project.

MOTION TO RECOMMEND APPROVAL TO THE PLANNING DIRECTOR WITH A CONDITION THAT HISTORY SAN JOSÉ BE CONSULTED IN THE DETAILS OF THE HISTORIC INFORMATION TO BE INSTALLED IN THE PARK, AND THAT THE INFORMATION BE REPORTED BACK TO HLC (6-0-1, LAVELLE ABSENT).

- d. [PDC07-033](#). The project being referred is a Planned Development Rezoning from the R-1-5(PD) Planned Development Zoning District and A – Agriculture Zoning District to the A(PD) Planned Development Zoning District to allow up to 379 single-family attached residences and 30,000 square feet for commercial uses on a 20.18 gross acres site, located on the southeast corner of Berryessa and Jackson Avenue (Pepper Lane Berryessa LLC, Myra Reinhard, Owners; Pulte Home Corporation, Developer). Council District 4. SNI: None. CEQA: MND In Process. *Project Manager, R. Matthew*

1. **Addition to the San José Historic Resources Inventory** of the single-family residence (13100 Berryessa Rd.) identified as qualified for the Inventory as a California Register eligible Structure of Merit.

Staff Recommendation: Historic Landmarks Commission adopt a Resolution listing the Qualifying Property on the City of San José Historic Resources Inventory.

2. **Mitigated Negative Declaration** for the Project.

Staff Recommendation: Historic Landmarks Commission provide comment regarding the proposed rehabilitation environmental mitigation measures, including on-site relocation of the identified CEQA historical resource.

Erika Salum, speaking on behalf of the applicant/developer Pulte Homes, emphasized the applicants' preference for the alternative of relocating the historical resource to the project's proposed central open space area. The subsequent discussion issues primarily included whether or not relocation of the house is a feasible/desirable option, how the house might be used in the future (whether or not relocation takes place), the extent of the impacts to the house's integrity that would result from relocating it into a central of area of the project for adaptive reuse, and how those impacts might be avoided or reduced (e.g., rehabilitating the house in its current location, relocating the house but maximizing a landscaped buffer zone around it). Sean Cottle, the property owners' representative, spoke in support of Pulte Homes' preference for relocating the house to the interior of the project for reuse as a clubhouse.

MOTION TO PLACE THE PROPERTY ON THE HRI AS A STRUCTURE OF MERIT. (6-0-1, LAVELLE ABSENT)

MOTION TO RECOMMEND THAT THE HOUSE BE RETAINED IN ITS CURRENT LOCATION AND INCORPORATED INTO THE PROPOSED PROJECT AND REHABILITATED. (2-4-1 JANKE, COLOMBE, PEAK, THACKER OPPOSED, LAVELLE ABSENT)

MOTION TO STATE THAT THE COMMISSION IS IN SUPPORT OF THE MITIGATION MEASURES IDENTIFIED IN THE M.N.D., BUT IN THE EVENT THAT THE MITIGATION TO RELOCATE THE HOUSE FOR ADAPTIVE REUSE ON SITE IS CHOSEN, THEN 1) THE OPEN SPACE "BUFFER ZONE" AROUND THE HOUSE SHOULD BE MAXIMIZED; AND 2) PLAQUES OR OTHER SIMILAR EDUCATION EXHIBITS INTERPRETING THE PROPERTY'S HISTORIC CONTEXT SHOULD BE PLACED ON THE SITE FOR FUTURE USERS OF THE HOUSE AS PART OF THE PROJECT. PASSED 5-1-1 (CUNNHINGHAM OPPOSED, LAVELLE ABSENT)

- e. **PDC06-094 Supplemental Memorandum.** The project being referred is a Planned Development Rezoning on a 4.4 gross acre site located at the southwest corner of Stockton Avenue and Cinnabar Street, to allow the development of up to 250 single-family attached residential units.

1. **Addition to the San José Historic Resources Inventory** of the commercial buildings located at 355 and 395 Stockton Avenue, identified as qualified for the Inventory as California Register eligible Structures of Merit.

Staff Recommendation: Historic Landmarks Commission adopt a Resolution listing the Qualifying Properties on the City of San José Historic Resources Inventory.

2. **Mitigated Negative Declaration** for the Project.

Staff Recommendation: Historic Landmarks Commission provide comment regarding the proposed rehabilitation environmental mitigation measures, including on-site and off-site relocation of the identified CEQA historical resources.

Erik Schoennauer, representing the project proponents, spoke in favor of the proposed project, including off-site relocation of the Carl Swenson building and on-site relocation, rehabilitation, and adaptive reuse of the former gas station building. Subsequent HLC discussion emphasized the issue of the appropriateness of off-site relocation of a Structure of Merit whose significance is based on its association with a notable personage as opposed to its architectural merits.

Commissioner Stabile noted that the office building does not tell us anything about itself, and that history would be better served with a plaque. Commissioner Thacker questioned the impact of relocation on the gas station and agreed that the office building did not convey its meaning. Chair Janke stated that the gas station was more significant than the office structure once moved to a new context.

MOTION NOT TO LIST THE CARL SWENSON OFFICE BUILDING ON THE HRI AND TO INSTEAD EXPRESS SUPPORT FOR A HISTORICAL PLAQUE OR MARKER IN THE ADJACENT PUBLIC RIGHT OF WAY. (5-1-1, PEAK OPPOSED, LAVELLE ABSENT).

MOTION TO LIST THE GAS STATION BUILDING ON THE HRI AND TO EXPRESS SUPPORT FOR ITS ON-SITE RELOCATION, INTEGRATION INTO THE NEW PROJECT, AND ADAPTIVE REUSE. (5-1-1 THACKER OPPOSED, LAVELLE ABSENT)

- f. **Historic Landmark Nomination Request** from the Historic Landmarks Commission for consideration of **Fire Station No. One**, located at 201 N. Market Street. *Staff indicated that, should the Council move to recommend initiating the Historic Landmark Structure designation, it would come back to this commission for comment and recommendation to the Council and then the Council would have the final decision to designate the property. The item tonight is to discuss whether the commission would like to begin the nomination process.*

MOTION TO RECOMMEND AGENDIZE THE NOMINATION OF FIRE HOUSE #1 AS A CITY LANDMARK. (6-0-1, LAVELLE ABSENT)

5. **REFERRALS FROM CITY COUNCIL, BOARDS, COMMISSIONS, OR OTHER AGENCIES**

- a. **PDC07-072**. The project being referred is a Planned Development Rezoning for a Campus Master Plan for Bellarmine College Preparatory, located in the area generally bounded by W. Hedding Street, the CalTrain right-of-way, Stockton Avenue, Emory Street, and Elm Street. The project includes the demolition of two existing academic buildings, the Schott Academic

Center (identified as a Structure of Merit) and Benson Hall. (Owner: Bellarmine College Preparatory) Council District: 6. SNI: None CEQA: Negative Declaration circulated 3-28-08 *Project Manager, E. Schreiner*

Staff Recommendation: Historic Landmarks Commission forward a recommendation regarding the disposition of the identified historic resource.

Paul Sheridan, representing the applicants, addressed the Commission and described the proposed construction that would occur after demolition of the two identified buildings. Ernie Yamane, architect, spoke regarding the architectural merits of the buildings proposed for demolition, and encouraged support for removal of the buildings. Thomas Gorndt also spoke in support of the proposed demolition.

MOTION TO RECOMMEND SUPPORT FOR ALLOWING DEMOLITION OF THESE TWO BUILDINGS SO THE APPLICANTS MAY PROCEED WITH THEIR CAMPUS MASTER PLAN. (6-0-1, LAVELLE ABSENT)

- b. [Washington Neighborhood Historic Context Survey.](#) Historic Context Survey for the area generally bounded by Interstate 280 on the north, South First Street/Monterey Road on the east, the Southern Pacific tracks south of Bellevue Avenue on the south and Highway 87 to the west. Council Districts: 3, 6, 7. SNI: Washington.

Staff Recommendation: Historic Landmarks Commission review and accept the Washington Neighborhood Historic Context Survey.

Franklin Maggi and Leslie Dill from Archives and Architecture presented the context survey. Planning staff gave an update on the next steps for the process. Now that the Context Survey is completed, the next step is to analyze the individual structures. The scope of work calls for 95 properties to be surveyed by June 30, 2008 and then as CDBG funds or other funds become available, then staff anticipates proceeding with further survey work. In August it is anticipated that staff will be able to update the Commission on any additional survey work that takes place and bring completed DPR's and evaluation tally sheets for possible additions to the Historic Resources Inventory.

MOTION TO ADOPT STAFF RECOMMENDATION (6-0-1, LAVELLE ABSENT)

- c. [Request for Endorsement of the San José Steam Railroad Museum](#) at the site of the terminus of the original 1863 San Francisco and San José Railroads.

Rod Diridon spoke in support of creation of a San José Steam Railroad Museum at the site of the terminus of the original 1863 San Francisco to San José Railroad, and requested HLC endorsement to this effect.

MOTION TO WRITE A LETTER SUPPORTING THE PROPOSED RAILROAD MUSEUM AND TO ASSIGN TWO OR THREE COMMISSIONERS TO WORK WITH STAFF IN DRAFTING THE LETTER (5-0-1-1, LAVELLE ABSENT, PEAK ABSTAINED).

- d. [Proposed Deaccessions from City Collections.](#)

Staff Recommendation: Historic Landmarks Commission accept the History San José (HSJ) summary statement and recommend approval of the proposed deaccessions in accordance with the HSJ Collections Management Policy.

MOTION TO RECOMMEND SUPPORT OF THE DEACCESSIONS. (6-0-1, LAVELLE ABSENT)

- e. [VTa Request for Comment](#) on proposed BART Diridon Arena Station design

VTa and City of San José DOT staff presented the current version of the proposed future BART station entrance. Commissioners inquired about the design's aesthetic and functional relationships with the adjacent historic train station.

- f. [Draft Evergreen-East Hills Development Policy](#) for the area generally located southerly of Story Road and Easterly of State Route 101, including the 14 gross acre Mirassou Winery site located on Aborn Road. Council District: 5, 7 and 8. SNI: K.O.N.A., East Valley/689, and Evergreen. CEQA: ADSEIR In Process. *Project Manager, R. Matthew*

Staff Recommendation: Historic Landmarks Commission to forward to the Planning Commission staff's recommended historical preservation criteria for the Evergreen-East Hills Development Policy.

Erik Schoennauer, representing Trumark Companies on the Mirassou property, endorsed the staff recommendation and recognized Planning staff Reena Mathew for doing an excellent job incorporating HLC's thoughts and comments from the last meeting regarding the nine identified criteria.

Commissioners' comments included concern about relying on new development to pay for historic rehabilitation; the adequacy of conformance to Secretary of the Interior's Standards as sufficient criteria in the Policy; the possibility of requiring a financial contribution to support historic survey efforts as a condition of approval for development for some project subject to the policy; and the possibility of creating an additional criterion establishing that, if a property has a historic resource on it, then a proposed project would still have to meet all of the other identified criteria for historic resources even if the 35-unit cap is released because of being a low-income residential or mixed-use project.

6. PETITIONS AND COMMUNICATIONS

- a. Public comments to the Historic Landmarks Commission on non-agendized items. Each member of the public may address the Commission for up to two minutes. The Commission cannot take any formal action without the item being properly noticed and placed on an agenda. In response to public comment, the Historic Landmarks Commission is limited to the following options:
1. Responding to statements made or questions posed by members of the public; or
 2. Requesting staff to report back on a matter at a subsequent meeting; or
 3. Directing staff to place the item on a future agenda

Leslie Masunaga, speaking on behalf of the Japantown Community Congress, advised that the annual spring festival will take place on Sunday, May 4, 11:00. The festival will include dedication of the benches that previously came before HLC for Section 106 review.

7. GOOD AND WELFARE

Continued to next hearing. Commissioner Stable stated she would like to report on her experience going before the Planning Commission regarding the Park View Towers EIR.

- a. Report from Secretary, Planning Commission, and City Council
 - 1. [Park View Towers \(H05-029, HP05-002, HP05-003\)](#)
 - 2. [CHRC Archaeological Resources Committee request for comment](#)
- b. Commissioners' report from Committees:
 - 1. Design Review Subcommittee (Janke, Colombe and Cunningham; Lavelle alternate)
 - 2. History San José Collections Committee (Stabile)
 - 3. Coyote Valley Specific Plan and Habitat Conservation Plan Advisory Committee (Cunningham)
 - 4. Japantown Survey Committee (Lavelle)
April 8, 2008 Community Meeting
 - 5. Pellier Park Committee (Colombe)
 - 6. City of San José BART extension, Design, Art & Architecture Review (Janke)
 - 7. GP Update Task Force Progress Report (Colombe and Thacker)
- c. [Review of 03/05/08 HLC Synopsis](#)
- d. Status of Circulation of Environmental Review Documents
<http://www.sanjoseca.gov/planning/eir/>
 - Demolition of the San José Medical Center ADEIR
July 2007 NOP Distribution
 - Japantown Corporation Yard
Anticipated 21 April 2008 DEIR Hearing
- e. Study Session Dates and Topics
 - 1. February 6th – Planning Department Website Re-design
 - 2. March 5th – CEQA: How to Review an EIR
 - 3. April 2nd – Preservation in San José's Future; Downtown, GP Update, and IBM 025/Ordinance Revisions Re: Vacant and Neglected Properties
- f. California Preservation Foundation Conference – Napa, CA
Wednesday, April 23, 2008 – Saturday, April 26, 2008

- g. Historic Preservation Month May 2008
- h. [San José Women's Club/Naglee Park Historic Homes Tour – Saturday, April 26, 2008](#)

8. ADJOURNMENT

2007 HISTORIC LANDMARKS COMMISSION MEETING SCHEDULE

DATE	TIME	TYPE OF MEETING	LOCATION
January 9, 2008	12:00 p.m.	Design Review Subcommittee	Room T-550
February 6, 2008	6:00 p.m.	Regular Meeting	Room W118-119
February 20, 2008	12:00 p.m.	Design Review Subcommittee	Cancelled
March 5, 2008	6:00 p.m.	Regular Meeting	Room W118-119
March 19, 2008	12:00 p.m.	Design Review Subcommittee	Cancelled
April 2, 2008	6:00 p.m.	Regular Meeting	Room W118-119
April 16, 2008	12:00 p.m.	Design Review Subcommittee	Room T-550
May 7, 2008	6:00 p.m.	Regular Meeting	Room W118-119
May 21, 2008	12:00 p.m.	Design Review Subcommittee	Room T-550
June 4, 2008	6:00 p.m.	Regular Meeting	Room W118-119
June 18, 2008	12:00 p.m.	Design Review Subcommittee	Room T-550
August 6, 2008	6:00 p.m.	Regular Meeting	Room W118-119
August 20, 2008	12:00 p.m.	Design Review Subcommittee	Room T-550
September 3, 2008	6:00 p.m.	Regular Meeting	Room W118-119
September 17, 2008	12:00 p.m.	Design Review Subcommittee	Room T-550
October 1, 2008	6:00 p.m.	Regular Meeting	Room W118-119
October 15, 2008	12:00 p.m.	Design Review Subcommittee	Room T-550
November 5, 2008	6:00 p.m.	Regular Meeting	Room W118-119
November 19, 2008	12:00 p.m.	Design Review Subcommittee	Room T-550
December 3, 2008	6:00 p.m.	Regular Meeting	Room W118-119
December 17, 2008	12:00 p.m.	Design Review Subcommittee	Room T-550

HISTORIC LANDMARKS AGENDA ON THE WEB:
<http://www.sanjoseca.gov/planning/hearings/historic.asp>